Suicide and employment status during Ireland’s Celtic Tiger economy

Paul Corcoran1,2, Ella Arensman1

1 National Suicide Research Foundation, 1 Perrott Avenue, College Road, Cork, Ireland
2 Department of Psychiatry, School of Medicine, University of Oviedo, Centro de Investigación Biomédica en Red de Salud Mental (CIBERSAM), Julian Claveria 6, 33006 Oviedo, Spain

Correspondence: Paul Corcoran, National Suicide Research Foundation, 1 Perrott Avenue, College Road, Cork, Ireland, tel: +353 21 4277499, fax: +353 21 4277545, e-mail: dpaulcorcoran@gmail.com

Received 22 April 2009, accepted 21 December 2009

Background: Studies have identified employment as a protective factor against suicide. We examined employment status and risk of suicide in Ireland during the 11-year period 1996–2006, a period of economic boom commonly known as the Celtic Tiger. Methods: Data relating to the 5270 suicides and 789 deaths of undetermined intent registered as occurring in Ireland in 1996–2006 and relevant population data were obtained from the Irish Central Statistics Office and analysed using Poisson regression. Results: Unemployment fell from 12% in 1996 to 4% in 2000, a level at which it remained until 2006. Male and female rates of suicide and undetermined death were stable during 1996–2006 though suicide among unemployed men increased. Relative to employment, unemployment was associated with a 2–3-fold increased risk of male suicide and undetermined death but generally a 4–6-fold increased risk in women. Unemployment was associated with greater increased risk of suicide and undetermined death when its level was low (2001–06) than in the period of decreasing unemployment (1996–2000). Unemployment was a stronger risk factor in men aged 35–54 years and with increasing age in women. Retired persons aged >55 years had a similar risk to their employed counterparts. Being a homemaker was associated with increased risk in women aged >35 years. Conclusion: The current Irish context of rapidly increasing unemployment suggests that rates may rise again as in previous recessions. Appropriate social policy responses are required to mitigate the potential impact of unemployment on suicides.

Keywords: economic recession, employment status, suicide, undetermined death, unemployment

Introduction

Studies examining the association between suicide and employment status at the individual level have generally shown unemployment to be a risk factor.1–3 Its effect has been shown to remain after adjustment for other socio-economic factors4,5 and factors related to mental health.6–8 Whether the extent to which the unemployed are at increased risk of adverse health outcomes including suicide is related to the general level of unemployment in the population has been investigated in a number of studies. Research in Finland9 and Sweden10 revealed that the association between unemployment and all-cause mortality was stronger in times and five times the suicide rate of their employed counterparts. In Northern Ireland, a case-control psychological autopsy study found unemployment to be a risk factor for suicide independent of current DSM-III-R Axis I (clinical syndrome) disorder(s).9 A second Northern Irish study involving record linkage between census and mortality data for the entire adult population showed significant variation in suicide risk by employment status. However, it was not the unemployed but the homemakers, permanently ill and a residual economically inactive group (i.e. excluding students and the retired) who were at increased risk of suicide after adjustment for self-rated general health, deprivation and other socio-demographic factors.13

In Ireland, the mid-1990s signalled the beginning of an economic boom, known as the Celtic Tiger. It was a period of unprecedented economic growth during which Ireland outpaced its European neighbours in job and wealth creation with an associated property boom and greatly increased cost of living. The aim of this study was to examine Irish suicide by employment status during the Celtic Tiger economy years, 1996–2006. In particular, we examined the association between unemployment and suicide during the initial period of decreasing unemployment and the later period of consistently low unemployment as well as interaction by age, gender and time period.

Methods

The Irish Central Statistics Office (CSO) provided data electronically relating to all deaths by suicide and deaths of undetermined intent (respectively, codes E950–959 and E980–989 of the Ninth Revision of the International Classification of Diseases, Injuries and Causes of Death) registered as occurring in 1996–2006, inclusively (2006 being the most recent year for which complete data were available). Annual population estimates (disaggregated by sex and 5-year age group) and population data from the 1996, 2002 and 2006 national censuses (disaggregated by sex, age group and employment status) were obtained from the CSO website (http://www.cso.ie/). For each age-sex-employment status
subgroup, population estimates were interpolated for the intercensal years by assuming that the population change from one census to the next involved constant year-to-year changes. The employment status categories used in Irish censuses differ slightly from those used in Irish mortality data (Supplementary table). Consequently, suicide rates could not be calculated separately for students, persons unable to work due to sickness or disability and male homemakers. Furthermore, the number of suicides of retired persons aged <55 years was too small to estimate their associated suicide risk. The annual unemployment rate, measured as the percentage of the labour force (the employed and the unemployed whether looking for first job or having lost a job) who were unemployed, was obtained from the website of LABORSTA, a database of the International Labour Office Bureau of Statistics (http://laborsta.ilo.org/).

**Statistical analysis**

Rates of suicide and suicide plus undetermined death (UD) were calculated using the Irish mortality data and the census-derived population data as the numerator and denominator, respectively. Annual rates of male and female (all ages) suicide and suicide plus UDs were age-standardized using the European standard population. Annual age-specific rates were calculated for 15–34, 35–54 and >55 year age groups. Annual age-standardized rates of suicide (>15 years) were also calculated for employed and unemployed men and women and for female homemakers. Poisson regression analysis was used to estimate time period, age, sex and employment status effects on the incidence of suicide and suicide plus UD in Ireland. For reasons explained above, the Poisson regression analysis was confined to men and women aged >15 years who were classified as employed or unemployed, men and women aged >55 years classified as retired and women aged >15 years classified as homemakers. Evidence of interaction between pairs of factors was assessed by fitting Poisson regression models with and then without the relevant interaction term and performing a likelihood ratio test (LRT). Main effects, interaction effects and their combined effects are reported as incidence rate ratios (IRRs) with their 95% confidence intervals (CIs) and P-values. Poisson regression models including age and employment status were derived separately for male and female suicide and male and female suicide plus UD in 1996–2000 and 2001–06. The independent main effects of age relative to the reference age group 15–34 years are reported. The main effects of employment status relative to the reference group, the employed, were combined with the interaction effects of employment status and age. These combined effects are reported and represent the effect of the employment status relative to the employed of the same age. The Poisson regression analyses were carried out using Stata version 6.0. While all analyses were carried out for suicide deaths only and for suicide plus UDs, results from the latter are presented. The trend in male and female suicide and unemployment is first presented, the trend in male and female unemployment being based on the LABORSTA data. Male and female suicide trends are then presented by age group and by employment status. Gender differences are detailed and then the effects of age and employment status are detailed separately for male and female suicide plus UD.

**Results**

**Unemployment and suicide trends**

Between 1996 and 2000, the rate of unemployment in Ireland fell from 12 to 4%, a level at which it remained from 2001 to 2006. A similar trend was observed in male and female unemployment although female unemployment was somewhat lower in 2002–06 (figure 1). During the 11 years 1996–2006, there were 5270 suicides [male: 4286 (81%); female: 984 (19%)] and 789 deaths of undetermined intent [male: 572 (72%); female: 217 (28%)] in Ireland. Male and female rates of suicide and suicide plus UD followed a similar trend and were fairly stable over the study period. The average male suicide rate was 20.0 per 100 000, approximately four times the female rate (4.7 per 100 000; ratio = 4.3). The 4-fold difference remained when UDs were added (male rate: 22.6 per 100 000; female rate: 5.7 per 100 000; ratio = 4.0).

![Figure 1](image-url) Rates of male and female unemployment and mortality due to suicide and suicide plus UD in Ireland, 1996–2006
Trends in male and female suicide plus UD were also relatively stable when examined by age group (figure 2). The highest male suicide rate was in 15–34-year-olds but in 2005 their rate converged with that of men aged 35–54 years. Older men had a far lower suicide rate. Differences between the age-specific female rates were smaller though women aged 35–54 years had the highest rate, younger women had the lowest rate and the rate in women aged >55 years fluctuated between the two.

Suicide trend by employment status
For men and women, the suicide plus UD rate was highest among the unemployed (figure 3). The rate among unemployed men increased markedly from 50.0 to 72.9 per 100,000 during the study period. Unemployed women had a similar rate to employed men. Women who were homemakers had an identical suicide plus UD rate to the employed until 2002 after which their rate was twice that of the employed.

Gender differences
The gender difference in the rate of suicide plus UD varied by age (LRT chi-square = 65.58, df = 2, P < 0.001). Among 15–34-year-olds, men had six times the rate of women (IRR = 6.28, 95% CI = 5.57–7.10, P < 0.001) whereas there was a <4-fold gender difference among 35–54-year-olds (IRR = 3.62, 95% CI = 3.26–4.02, P < 0.001) and >55-year-olds (IRR = 3.32, 95% CI = 2.91–3.78, P < 0.001). The effect of employment status differed between men and women (LRT chi-square = 28.32, df = 2, P < 0.001). Relative to being employed, being unemployed was associated with an almost 5-fold increased risk of female suicide plus UD (IRR = 4.76, 95% CI = 3.99–5.67, P < 0.001). In contrast, unemployed men had almost three times the risk of the employed (IRR = 2.82, 95% CI = 2.62–3.02, P < 0.001).

Age and employment status effects on male suicide and UD
The impact of unemployment on male suicide plus UD differed between 1996–2000 and 2001–06 (LRT chi-square = 14.10, df = 1, P < 0.001), particularly for men aged 15–34 years. Those unemployed in 1996–2000 had twice the rate of suicide plus UD of their employed counterparts but there was a 3-fold difference in 2001–06 (table 1).

In 1996–2000, men aged >35 years had a suicide plus UD risk one-third lower than younger men but this difference diminished in 2001–06. In addition, age modified the effect of being unemployed in 1996–2000 (LRT chi-square = 6.69, df = 2, P = 0.035). Unemployed men aged 15–34 years had twice the risk of employed men of the same age but this risk increase was one-third greater in 35–54-year-olds (Interaction IRR = 1.34, 95% CI = 1.07–1.67, P = 0.010). Age also modified the effect of unemployment on risk of male suicide plus UD in 2001–06 (LRT chi-square = 9.31, df = 2, P = 0.010). Unemployment was associated with at least a 3-fold increased risk among 15–34- and 35–54-year-olds compared with a doubling of risk in >55-year-olds. Among men aged >55 years, those who had retired had a similar rate of suicide plus UD to those in employment.

Figure 2 Age–sex-specific rate of suicide plus UD in Ireland, 1996–2006. Three year moving averages of the annual rates are shown. Data for 1995–97 were used in the calculation of the moving average displayed for 1996

Suicide and employment status
The increased risk of suicide plus UD associated with unemployment was greater in women than in men irrespective of age (Table 1). The associations between female suicide plus UD and employment status in 1996–2000 differed from those in 2001–06 (LRT chi-square = 16.12, df = 3, P = 0.001). The incidence of suicide plus UD among homemakers, relative to the employed, was higher in 2001–2006 than it was in 1996–2000 whereas the opposite occurred for the retired (>55 years). Among >35-year-olds, the increased risk associated with unemployment appeared greater in 2001–06 than in 1996–2000 but the difference did not reach statistical significance (interaction IRR = 1.26, 95% CI = 0.76–2.10, P = 0.373).

The risk of female suicide plus UD associated with being a homemaker varied by age in 1996–2000 (LRT chi-square = 11.04, df = 2, P = 0.004) and in 2001–06 (LRT chi-square = 10.74, df = 2, P = 0.005). In 1996–2000, young homemakers had half the risk of young employed women but being a homemaker was not protective for older women. In 2001–2006, young homemakers had the same risk of suicide
plus UD as the employed but with increasing age being a homemaker was associated with significantly increased risk. Unemployment was a stronger risk factor with increasing age in women. This effect modification was strongest, but only approached statistical significance, in 2001–2006 (LRT chi-square = 4.84, df = 2, \( P = 0.089 \)) when the 4-fold increased risk associated with unemployment among 15–34-year-olds was 50% stronger in 35–54-year-olds (interaction IRR = 1.49, 95% CI = 0.92–2.42, \( P = 0.109 \)) and two times stronger in women aged >55 years (interaction IRR = 2.17, 95% CI = 0.99–4.75, \( P = 0.053 \)).

**Discussion**

The Celtic Tiger economy in Ireland reduced unemployment from 12% in 1996 to 4% in 2000, a level at which it remained until 2006. Male and female rates of suicide plus UD were relatively stable during 1996–2006. Unemployed men and women had far higher rates than their employed counterparts but unemployment was a stronger risk factor for women.

Unemployment was a stronger risk factor when it was rare (2001–06) than in the period of decreasing unemployment (1996–2000). Relative to the employed, young female homemakers were protected from suicide in 1996–2000 but not in 2001–06 whereas older homemakers had higher rates. In relation to age, unemployment was a stronger suicide risk factor for men aged 35–54 years and with increasing age for women. The results of the analysis of the suicide data alone were highly consistent with those based on suicide and UDs though it was notable that the strength of the effect of unemployment was marginally greater when UDs were included.

Our finding that unemployment was a stronger risk factor for female suicide than for male suicide is consistent with record linkage/longitudinal studies in the UK and Wales⁵ and the USA⁶ but not with similarly designed studies in Denmark⁷ and New Zealand¹⁶ and an Italian study of national suicide rates.¹¹ The finding has been related to increased female participation in the labour force and increased investment by women in their socio-economic.

---

**Figure 3** Male and female rate of suicide plus UD in Ireland by employment status, 1996–2006

**Table 1** Effects of age and employment status on male and female rates of suicide plus UD during Ireland’s years of decreasing unemployment (1996–2000) and low unemployment (2001–06)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age (years)</td>
<td>15–34 (reference group)</td>
<td>1.00 (1.00–1.00)</td>
<td>1.00 (1.00–1.00)</td>
<td>1.00 (1.00–1.00)</td>
<td>1.00 (1.00–1.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35–54</td>
<td>0.70 (0.62–0.79)</td>
<td>0.82 (0.74–0.91)</td>
<td>1.25 (0.90–1.74)</td>
<td>1.12 (0.86–1.46)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>≥55</td>
<td>0.66 (0.55–0.80)</td>
<td>0.80 (0.69–0.94)</td>
<td>0.81 (0.41–1.63)</td>
<td>0.88 (0.54–1.43)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status (reference group is the employed of the same age)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed aged 15–34</td>
<td>2.12 (1.83–2.46)</td>
<td>3.06 (2.69–3.50)</td>
<td>4.41 (3.06–6.37)</td>
<td>3.97 (2.82–5.58)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed aged 35–54</td>
<td>2.84 (2.41–3.36)</td>
<td>3.63 (3.12–4.22)</td>
<td>4.99 (3.23–7.68)</td>
<td>5.91 (4.18–8.35)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed aged &gt;55</td>
<td>2.33 (1.64–3.31)</td>
<td>2.13 (1.52–2.97)</td>
<td>5.25 (1.62–17.03)</td>
<td>8.61 (4.25–17.42)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired aged &gt;55</td>
<td>0.88 (0.71–1.10)</td>
<td>0.84 (0.70–1.00)</td>
<td>1.52 (0.72–3.19)</td>
<td>0.71 (0.40–1.46)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homemaker aged 15–34</td>
<td>– – – –</td>
<td>0.45 (0.22–0.93)</td>
<td>0.87 (0.52–1.46)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homemaker aged 35–54</td>
<td>– – – –</td>
<td>1.38 (1.01–1.88)</td>
<td>1.84 (1.41–2.40)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homemaker aged &gt;55</td>
<td>– – – –</td>
<td>1.76 (0.88–3.50)</td>
<td>2.52 (1.55–4.08)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\*\( P < 0.05 \); **\( P < 0.01 \); ***\( P < 0.001 \).
roles.4,7,17,18 Both would apply to Ireland and these factors may also be relevant to the finding that the protective effect of employment increased with age among women. That unemployment was a stronger risk factor for men aged 35–54 years and older women is also supported by studies that have shown young unemployed people to experience less psychological distress than the middle-aged unemployed,19,20 for whom the consequences of being out of work may be more serious as they are likely to have greater financial and family commitments and may suffer a greater loss in status and security by being unemployed than a young person.21 That young female homemakers were at low risk of suicide may relate to having a young child, a highly protective factor against female suicide.22

Studies of all-cause mortality in Finland and Sweden23 and studies of hospital-treated non-fatal suicidal behaviour in Helsinki and Edinburgh24 have also shown unemployment to be a stronger risk factor when its level was low. In contrast, an Italian study,25 more similar to ours as it involved analysis of national suicide rates by employment status in a period of changing levels of unemployment, found the risk of suicide in the unemployed increased relative to the employed as the general level of unemployment increased.

There are two broad explanations for the association between unemployment and suicide: firstly, health selection, whereby pre-existing vulnerabilities such as mental illness lead to and/or maintain the state of unemployment and it is these vulnerabilities that lead to suicide; secondly, unemployment causes vulnerability to suicide by causing stress and financial worry, loss of self-esteem, social disintegration, threats to healthy routine and sense of purpose all of which increase vulnerability to suicide by causing stress and financial worry, loss of self-esteem, social disintegration, threats to healthy routine and sense of purpose all of which increase vulnerability to suicide by causing stress and financial worry, loss of self-esteem, social disintegration, threats to healthy routine and sense of purpose all of which increase suicide risk after adjustment for factors related to mental health.8–8 Furthermore, adjusting for confounders is more important in longitudinal studies than in ours as we assessed differences in relative risk of suicide in two consecutive time periods. Confounders could be expected to operate similarly in both periods and therefore the changes in relative risk may be unaffected by confounding.

During Ireland’s Celtic Tiger economy, unemployment fell and male suicide rates levelled off. Whether the latter is attributable to the Celtic Tiger or to Ireland’s suicide prevention efforts cannot be determined given the difficulties inherent in assessing the impact of suicide prevention strategies.27,28 However, Ireland is now in economic crisis with rapidly increasing unemployment. Our previous experiences of increasing unemployment in the late 1970s and early 1980s saw increases in suicide, primarily among men. Experience in other countries has been mixed. Rapidly increasing unemployment in the early 1990s was not associated with increases in suicide rates in Sweden29 and Finland30 but was associated with 30–40% increases in male and female suicide in Italy, albeit from low baseline rates.11 The extreme economic crisis in South Korea in 1998 was associated with a 40% increase in the national suicide rate for that year but the South Korean economy recovered quickly and the suicide rate returned to pre-crisis levels.31,32 A recent study of the 26 European Union countries reported that an increase in unemployment of at least 3% was associated with a 4.45% increase in suicides among <65-year-olds.33 Ireland’s unemployment rate increased by at least 3% in 2008 and again in 2009. This suggests that the recent period of stable Irish suicide rates may be over and that Irish suicide may increase again as in previous times of recession. However, with increasing unemployment, we believe there will be a weakening of the risk of suicide in the unemployed relative to the employed which may offset some of the anticipated rise in suicides. It has also been shown that higher social spending on active labour market programmes aimed at keeping and retraining workers in jobs reduced the effect of unemployment on suicides.33 It is important that policy makers choose to increase investment in a range of appropriate social policy responses to mitigate the potential impact of unemployment on suicide.34

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge the staff of the Irish Central Statistics Office for their work in compiling the data
upon which this article is based and to thank Dr Udo Reulbach for his helpful comments on the article.

**Funding**

This study was supported by the Irish Health Service Executive National Office for Suicide Prevention.

**Conflicts of interest:** None declared.

### Key points

- Ireland’s economic boom was associated with stable rates of suicide and UD overall but an increasing rate in unemployed men.
- The rate increase in suicide associated with unemployment varied with the general level of unemployment, being greater when the level of unemployment was low than in the period of decreasing unemployment.
- Unemployment was associated with greater increased risk in women than in men.
- Among men, unemployment was a stronger suicide risk factor among 35–54-year-olds whereas its negative effect increased with age among women.

### References